

Calling out

YA

Rasoolallah

صلى الله عليه وآله

By

Mufti Ahmad Yar Khan Naeemi رَحْمَةُ اللهِ عَلَيْهِ

Translated by

Maulana Omar Qadri Moeeni

www.jannatikaun.com

To call out to the Holy Prophet ﷺ is permissible, whether it is done from far or near, during his visible life or after his demise, or by one person or a congregation collectively. This discussion is divided into two chapters.

PROOF OF PROCLAIMING "YA RASOOLALLAH ﷺ"

To call out to the Prophet ﷺ is proven from the Holy Quran, the actions of the angels and the practice of the Sahaaba ؓ and Ummah. The Holy Quran has called out the Holy Prophet ﷺ in several places, e.g. "Ya Ayuhan-Nabi," "Ya Ayuhar-Rasool," etc. Calling to the Prophet ﷺ is proven from all of these ayats. Yes, other Ambiya were called by their names, e.g. "Ya Musa ؑ," "Ya Esa ؑ," "Ya Yahya ؑ" etc. but our Beloved Master has been addressed with appreciative titles:

يا ايها النبي ، يا ايها الرسول ، يا ايها المزمّل ، يا ايها المدثر

In fact, the Holy Quran has even called out the general body of Muslims, "Ya Ayuhalazina Aamanoo," and has ordered Muslims to call out and address the Holy Prophet ﷺ with cherished titles,

"يا ايها الذين امنوا لا تجعلوا دعاء الرسول بينكم كدعاء بعضكم بعضا"

This ayat doesn't disallow addressing the Holy Prophet ﷺ. Rather, it says that he shouldn't be addressed like ordinary people.

The Holy Quran states, "Call and address them, relating them to their fathers." This verse allows calling out to Hadrat Zaid ibn Haaritha ؓ. However, he should not be addressed as "the son of Rasoolullah ﷺ", but "the son of Haaritha". Likewise, the Kuffaar

have been allowed to call their helpers for assistance,

“و ادعوا شهداءكم من دور الله ان كنتم صدقين”

In the first Hadith of Mishkaat Sharif, Hadrat Jibraeel عليه السلام submitted, يا محمد اخبرني عن الاسلام. Calling out (nidaa) is found here. At the time of the Holy Prophet's صلى الله عليه وسلم passing away, the Angel of Death جبرائيل said, “يا محمد ان الله ارسلني اليك” -*Mishkaat, Baabu Wafaatin-Nabi* صلى الله عليه وسلم

Calling out is proven here as well. Hadrat Uthman ibn Haneef رضي الله عنه reports that a blind person came to Rasoolullah صلى الله عليه وسلم and requested a dua. Sayyiduna Rasoolullah صلى الله عليه وسلم instructed him to make the following supplication, "O Allah الله! I ask from Thee and turn towards You with the Prophet of Mercy, Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم. Ya

Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم! I have turned towards my Lord using your means in this need of mine so that it is fulfilled. Ya Allah الله! Accept the intercession of Rasoolullah صلى الله عليه وسلم for me." Hadrat Abu Ishaq رضي الله عنه states that this Hadith is Sahih (sound)." -*Ibn Majah, Baabu Salaatil-Haaja*

This dua was taught to all Muslims until the Day of Qiyaamat. It proves that the permissibility of calling out, and help from the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم was invoked in it.

Alamghiri states, "Peace be upon you, O Nabi صلى الله عليه وسلم! I testify that you are the Messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وسلم." -*Kitaabul-Hajj, Adaabu Ziyaaratil-Qabrin-Nabi* صلى الله عليه وسلم

After this, the book further states, "Salaam to Hadrat Abu Bakr Siddique رضي الله عنه must be made by saying the following, "Peace be upon you, the true successor of Rasoolullah صلى الله عليه وسلم, Peace be upon you, the Companion of the Noble Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم in the cave." - *Ibid*

It also states, "The following should be said when

presenting Salaam to Hadrat Umar Farooq-e-Azam ؓ, "Peace be upon you, O Leader of the Muslims. Peace be upon you, the Illuminator of Islam. Peace be upon you, the destroyer of idols."
-Ibid

Calling out to both Rasoolullah ﷺ and the two Companions at his side, Hadrat Abu Bakr ؓ and Hadrat Umar ؓ, is found in these extracts.

Superior and senior Saints (Auliya) and pious people of this Ummat used to say, "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ" in their supplications and religious recitals (wazifas). Imam Busairi ؓ writes, "O Greatest of Creation ﷺ! There is none besides you for me to take refuge in at the time of difficulties." – *Qasida Burda*

Imam Zainul-Abideen ؓ states in his Qasida, "Ya Rahmatulil-Aalameen ﷺ! Come and assist Zainul-Aabideen because he is a prisoner at the hands of oppressors in this procession."

Maulana Jaami ؓ states, "The life of the world is diminishing because of separation. Ya Nabi ﷺ! Have mercy. Are you not Rahmatulil-Aalameen? Why then are we criminals distant from the attention of your mercy?"

Sayyiduna Jmam-e-Aazam Abu Hanifa ؓ states, "O Leader of all leaders ﷺ! I come to your august court with a heartfelt desire. I am hopeful of your pleasure (radaa) and hand myself over to your protection."

These extracts establish calling out to Sayyiduna Rasoolullah ﷺ as well as seeking assistance (istiaanat) from him. All of the above calls were made from afar and after the Holy Prophet's ﷺ demise.

Muslims say in namaaz "السلام عليك ايها النبي ورحمة الله وبركاته" Addressing the Noble Messenger ﷺ at this juncture is compulsory (Waaajib). Extracts from the books Shaami and Ashiatul-Lam'aat,

concerning At-Tahiyaat, have already been presented in the discussion of Haazir & Naazir. Refer to them there. All of the above was in regards to calling out "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ individually.

Many people collectively making a *naraa* (shout) of Risaalat (i.e. saying "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ) is also permissible because, if doing so individually is allowed, then surely nothing prohibits saying "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ collectively! A few permissible things coming together causes its result and collection to be allowed. Just as how biryaani (a kind of food) is permissible because it is a collection of Halaal ingredients, so too is this also explicitly proven.

Hadrat Baraa ؓ narrates that when the Holy Prophet ﷺ entered Madina Sharif after migrating from Makkah, "...men and women ascended the roofs of their homes. The children and slaves went out to the streets and began to call out, "Ya Muhammad ﷺ! Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ! Ya Muhammad ﷺ! Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ!" –*Muslim, Vol. 2, Baabu Hadeethil-Hijrat*

This Hadith of Muslim Sharif proves the permissibility of making the *naraa* of risaalat, and we also conclude that the blessed Sahaaba used to practice it. The narration further states that the Sahaaba organized a march (juloos) to welcome the Holy Prophet ﷺ to Madina. Whenever the Prophet ﷺ returned from a journey, the residents of the city used to march to welcome him. - *Mishkaat, Bukhari, etc.*

"Jalsa" means *sitting*, and "juloos" is its plural. Namaaz is the jalsa of Divine remembrance (zikr) because it occurs at only one place while Hajj is the juloos of remembrance because it occurs in many places. It is proven from the Quran that the angels brought the Ark of the Covenant (Taaboot-e-Sakina) in a march (juloos). At the time of the Holy Prophet's ﷺ birth and Me'raj, angels coordinated themselves in Juloos. Emulating the good is a means of reward. Hence, the marches (juloos) which we hold is an emulation of these practices and a means of attaining thawaab.

OBJECTIONS & ANSWERS TO CALLING OUT "YA RASOOLALLAH ﷺ"

OBJECTION 1

The Holy Quran states, "Besides Allah ﷻ, do not call out to anyone who can neither grant you benefit nor inflict harm." – *Surah Yusuf, Verse 106*

We can ascertain from this that to call out to anyone besides Allah ﷻ is prohibited and is the practice of idol-worshippers.

Answer – The word "dua" in these ayats and others like it doesn't mean *to call*, but *to worship* (ref. Tafseer Jalaalain and other Commentaries of the Holy Quran). Therefore, the meaning of these ayats is that no one except Allah ﷻ should be worshipped. Other verses corroborate this meaning. Allah ﷻ states, "And who calls another to be worshipped (ma'bood) with Allah ﷻ ("calls" here meaning worship)." – *Surah Muminoon, Verse 117*

We now understand that deeming someone besides Allah ﷻ to be Allah ﷻ and calling out to him is polytheism (shirk) because this is worship of someone who isn't Allah ﷻ. If this meaning was not asserted to these ayats, then all of the extracts we have produced from the Quran, Hadith and rulings of the Ulama wherein calling to others besides Allah ﷻ was found will all prove to be polytheism. Then calling or addressing anyone, whether near or far, alive or deceased, will all equal polytheism. We daily address and call out to our family and friends. Therefore, there will be no one in this world free from shirk. Also, shirk is termed as ascribing a partner to Allah ﷻ in His being and qualities. So, why would calling out to or addressing someone be taken as applying Divine attributes to that person? How can this be polytheism?

OBJECTION 2

"Remember Allah ﷻ sitting, standing and while resting." ¹ It is known from this that to respect the name of

someone besides Allah ﷻ while sitting or standing is polytheism. Only Allah's ﷻ remembrance should be made at all intervals.

Answer – Deeming remembering Rasoolullah ﷺ as Haraam or polytheism (shirk) based on this verse is ignorance. The ayat merely states that when you are finished with namaaz, you may make Allah's ﷻ zikr in every condition and state. In other words, namaaz has restrictions (e.g. it cannot be done without wudhu, Quran must not be recited during sajda, mku or while sitting and that it (Salaah) should not be made sitting or lying down without a valid excuse) but when it is completed, these limitations are lifted. Now, you may make the remembrance of Allah ﷻ standing, sitting, lying down or in any other condition.

After paying special attention to this ayat, the following points clearly emerge,

1. The imperitive "Remember Allah ﷻ" is not for obligation (Wujoob) but for permissibility (jawaaz). Meaning, out of namaaz you have the choice to remember Allah ﷻ or others besides Him, or remain silent altogether. All of the above is allowed.
2. Even if this command was for obligation, still too would the remembrance of someone besides Allah ﷻ not be the abrogation of Allah's ﷻ remembrance (i.e. that by His remembrance becoming compulsory, remembering someone else besides Him becomes Haraam). Rather, the abrogation of Allah's ﷻ remembrance (zikr) is not making His remembrance at all.
3. The zikr of Rasoolullah ﷺ is indirectly the remembrance of Allah ﷻ. "Whoever is obedient to the Rasool ﷺ has shown obedience to Allah ﷻ." – *Surah Nisaa, Verse 80*

When the Holy Prophet's ﷺ remembrance is included in the Kalima, Namaaz, Hajj, Durood, Khutba, Azaan — in short, all forms of worship and is necessary in them, how

can this remembrance become Haraam if made out of Salaah, whether whilst standing or sitting? Whoever recites Durood Sharif of the Kalima while standing, sitting or in any other condition is making the zikr of Rasoolullah ﷺ and is worthy of thawaab.

4. Is reciting ayats that specifically mention the Kuffaar or idols, e.g. Surah Lahab, Surah Munafiqoon, etc. the remembrance (zikr) of Allah ﷻ or not? Surely it is because these are Quranic verses. There is reward for every word. Even though the subject of these verses is the Kuffaar or idols, the speech (kalaam) is definitely Allah's ﷻ. The remembrance of Allah's ﷻ speech is His remembrance. However, according to you, the remembrance of the Mercy, Noor and Prophet of Allah ﷻ, Muhammadur-Rasoolullah ﷺ, cannot be the remembrance of Allah ﷻ! How is this fair? The Holy Quran states, "Qaala Firaun." The reciter of "Qaala" attains 30 thawaab for this and 50 for "Firaun", because the reward for every letter read is multiplied by 10. So 50 thawaab was attained from reading the name of Firaun in the Quran, tyit taking the name of Sayyiduna Rasoolullah, Muhammad ﷺ is equal to polytheism? What kind of intelligence is this?
5. Due to being separated from Hadrat Yusuf ﷺ, Hadrat Yaqoob ﷺ used to repeat his name whether he was sitting or standing. He cried so much that his eyes became white. Likewise, when Hadrat Adam ﷺ was separated from Sayyidah Hawa ﷻ and Imam Zainul-Aabideen ﷻ from Imam Husain ﷻ, they would both repeat the names of their loved ones sitting or standing. Tell us, will the ruling of polytheism (shirk) apply to them as well? If the answer is "No", why then will the lover of Rasoolullah ﷺ who takes his Nabi's ﷺ frame at every turn become a mushrik today? Day and ru'ght a businessman talks and thinks of his business, while a student repeats his lesson to memorize it. This is also the repetition of someone or something

besides Allah ﷻ. Will they also be labeled as Mushriks?

Note – A debate on this topic of calling out "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ" occurred between Maulwi Thanauallah Amritsari and I in Deena Nagar, Punjab. Maulwi Sahib presented this very ayat. I asked him only three questions,

1. How many meanings does a command (amr) have in the Holy Quran and which one applies here?
2. Will one opposite (naqeed) becoming Waajib make the other Haraam?
3. What is the opposite of the remembrance of Allah ﷻ? Is it remembering someone besides Him, or not making His remembrance at all?

He replied, "You have brought Principles of Fiqh (Usool-e-Fiqh) and logic (Mantiq) into these questions. Both these Sciences are Innovated (Bidat)." (In other words, being an ignorant person is Sunnat, according to him). I then asked him to correctly define Innovation (Bidat), showing how gatherings of Meelad become Haraam according to him but taking out a magazine propagating the beliefs of the "Ahle-Hadith" is Sunnat. These questions still need to be answered by him (and today, remain unanswered by both him and his supporters).

OBJECTION 3

Hadrat Abdullah ibn Mas'ood ؓ reports that the Holy Prophet ﷺ taught them At-Tahiyaat in the following words,

“السلام عليك ايها النبي ورحمة الله وبركاته”

When the Prophet ﷺ passed away, we read At-Tahiyaat in the following manner,

“فلما قبض قلنا السلام على يعنى على النبي
صلى الله عليه وسلم”

Imam Aini رحمہ اللہ writes under this Hadith, "The apparent meaning of this is that the Sahaaba used the 'kaaf for addressing the Prophet ﷺ in "As-Salaamu Alaika (Peace be upon you...)" during his time. When he passed away, they stopped this and began to use the word for absence, saying, "As-Salaamu alan-Nabi" (Peace be upon the Prophet ﷺ..." – *Aini Sharah Bukhari*

This Hadith and its annotation prove that "As-Salaamu Alaika" was said in At-Tahiyaat during the time of Rasoolullah ﷺ, but after his demise, calling out to him in it was forsaken. Thus, when the Sahaaba omitted calling out to him in At-Tahiyaat, then the person who proclaims "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ" etc. out of namaaz is a Mushrik indeed.

Answer – These extracts from Bukhari and Aini are contrary to you as well because no Mujtahid Imam, even until today, has ordered that the At-Tahiyaat be changed. Imam Abu Hanifa رحمہ اللہ and Imam Shafee رحمہ اللہ adopted the At-Tahiyaat narrated by Hadrat Ibn Mas'ood رضی اللہ عنہ and Hadrat Ibn Abbas رضی اللہ عنہ respectively, but "As-Salaamu Alaika" is present in both their narrations. Ghair-Muqallids (those who reject the Four Imams رحمہم اللہ) also read this At-Tahiyaat with addressing. This leads us to deduce that some Companions changed the At-Tahiyaat through their ijtihaad. However, in the presence of a *marfoo* Hadith, the ijtihaad of a Sahaabi is not accepted. These Sahaaba didn't change it because calling out to the unseen is Haraam. Otherwise, the Sahaaba who lived far away during the time of the Holy Prophet ﷺ would not have recited it even during the Prophet's ﷺ life. Namaaz was being performed everywhere, e.g. Yemen, Khaibar, Makkah, Iraq, Najd, etc. and this very At-Tahiyaat was also read everywhere. Calling out to the unseen was continuously being made because the Holy Prophet ﷺ was present in Hijaz whilst the At-Tahiyaat with addressing was being read everywhere. Neither did the Prophet ﷺ prohibit this nor did the Sahaaba object to it. When teaching the At-Tahiyaat, Rasoolullah ﷺ didn't say that this At-Tahiyaat is to be read only during my lifetime and another must be

read after my demise.

Maulwi Rashid Cangohi writes, "Therefore, to change the wording of address is not necessary, and neither is making the Taqleed of some Saahaba in this matter. Otherwise, the Holy Prophet ﷺ himself would have said that addressing shouldn't be done after his passing away. In any case, to adopt the wording of address is better because it was originally taught in this manner. - *Fatawa Rashidia, Vol. 1, Kitaabul-Aqaa'id, Pg. 17*

In short, this action of some Sahaaba is not a proof, otherwise it will mean that polytheism (shirk) was being made during the Holy Prophet's ﷺ time and he didn't stop it. Also, only some, not all of the Sahaaba, changed it afterwards. In fact, Mulla Ali Qaari ؒ writes,

”قول ابن مسعود كنا نقول الخ فهو رواية ابي عوامة و رواية البخارى اصح فيها بينت ان ذلك ليس من قول ابن مسعود بل من فهم الراوى عنه و لفظهما فلما قبض قلنا سلام يعنى على النبى فقوله قلنا سلام يحتمل انه اراد به استممرنا على ما كنا عليه فى حياته“

– *Mirqaat, Baabut-Tashahud, Last Section*

We know from this that the Sahaaba never did change the At-Tahiyaat. This is only the understanding of the narrator and is not what truly happened.

OBJECTION 4

It is polytheism to call out to a Prophet or Saint from afar, believing them to hear these callings, because hearing from far is only a quality of Allah ﷻ. Accepting this power to be possessed by someone other than Him is ascribing partners to Him. If this belief was not held, then saying, "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ, Ya Ghaus ؒ," etc. would be allowed just as how it is permissible to call out to the winds, e.g. "O wind!" Here, it is not believed that the winds hear. (Fataawa Rashidia and other books of Wahabis stress this point.)

Answer – Hearing distant voices and callings is *absolutely* not the quality of Allah ﷻ, because only he who is far from the caller hears callings from afar. Allah ﷻ is closer to us than our own jugular veins. He Himself states, "We are more closer to him than his jugular vein (i.e. his life source)," ⁵¹⁹ "When My servants ask you about Me, then say that I am close," and "We are more closer to him than you are but you don't see." Allah ﷻ hears all callings and voices because all voices are near to Him and He Himself is close.

Also, even if it is accepted that hearing from a distance is Allah's ﷻ quality, then hearing from near is also His quality. So if we now believe that someone has heard something from near, will we be ascribing partners to Allah ﷻ?! Everybody should be believed to be deaf.

Just as how hearing distant voices is a quality (sifat) of Allah ﷻ, so too are seeing distant things and objects and attaining a scent from afar. We have already proven in the discussion of Knowledge of the Unseen and Haazir & Naazir that both far and near are equal for the Friends (Auliya) of Allah ﷻ. When their eyes can see both far and near equally, why does it become polytheism for their ears to hear distant sounds? They have attained this ability through Allah's ﷻ bestowal. We now prove that the Prophets and Saints hear distant sounds and callings:

While in Kinaan, Hadrat Yaqoob عليه السلام attained the scent of Hadrat Yusuf's عليه السلام shirt and said, "انى لا جدريح يوسف" Is this polytheism or not?

While in Madina, Hadrat Umar رضي الله عنه called out to Hadrat Saaria رضي الله عنها who was present in Nawaahind during a jihad. The latter heard this call. – *Mishkaat, Baabul-Karaamat, Section 3*

The eye of Hadrat Umar رضي الله عنه saw from afar and the ear of Hadrat Saaria رضي الله عنها heard a distant calling. Commentating on the ayat, Mufasssireen state that when Hadrat Ibraheem عليه السلام completed the construction of the Holy Kaaba, he ascended a mountain and

called out to all the souls, "O Servants of Allah ﷻ! Come!" Everybody who will be born until Qiyaamat heard this. The soul that said "Labbaik" on this calling will definitely go for Hajj and the soul that remained silent shall never. - *Tafseer Roohul-Bayaan, Jalaalain, Madaarik*

Here, nevermind being far, all souls heard the calling of Hadrat Ibraheem ؑ before even being born! Is this polytheism or not? Hadrat Ibraheem ؑ also submitted, "O Allah ﷻ! Show me how You give life to the dead." He was ordered to slaughter four birds and put their flesh on four mountains. "Then call them, they will come hastily towards you." - *Surah Baqarah, Verse 260*

Here, dead animals were called and they quickly came forward. So are the Saints lesser than these animals? Sitting in Cape Town, a person can converse with someone in London with a phone. The former speaks to the latter with the belief that he can hear him through this instrument. Will this calling be polytheism (shirk) or not? So, if a Muslim who believes that the power of prophethood is more than the power of this telephone, and that the Nabi ﷺ, through this Divinely bestowed ability, hears his calling and thus calls out, "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ Al-Ghiyaath," how can polytheism be made? While on a journey, Hadrat Sulaiman ؑ heard the voice of an ant in the jungle from afar. It said, "Ants! Go into your homes lest Sulaiman ؑ and his army crush you unknowingly." - *Surah Naml, Verse 18*

Under this ayat, Tafseer Roohul-Bayaan states that Hadrat Sulaiman ؑ heard the voice of this ant from a distant of three miles. Think, the voice of an ant and the distance of three miles!? Is this polytheism or not?

The Ahadith state that after burial, the deceased in the Qabr hears the sound of the feet of those outside. He also sees and recognizes those who visit the grave. This is why Salaam should be made to the inmates of the graves when entering the graveyard. - *Mishkaat, Baabu Ithbaati Azaabil-Qabr*

Under so much of sand, being able to hear even a soft sound is definitely hearing from afar. Is this shirk or not? hi the

discussion of Knowledge of the Unseen of the Prophets, we have already produced the Hadith which states that the Friend of Allah ﷺ sees, hears and touches with Divinely bestowed power. - *Mishkaat, Kitaabud-Dawaat*

If the person, whom Allah ﷻ has granted this ability to, hears from afar, how is this proving partnership to Allah ﷻ?

A trusted Aalim of the opposition, Maulwi Abdul-Hayy Lucknowi, records the following Hadith. Hadrat Abbas ؓ asked, "Ya Rasoolallah ﷺ! What did the moon do when you were an infant of 40 days?" Sayyiduna Rasoolullah ﷺ replied, "My compassionate mother put my hands tightly together. When I began to cry due to some discomfort, the moon used to console me and stop me from crying." Hadrat Ibn Abbas ؓ asked, "At that time you were a baby of 40 days old, so how do you know this?" Rasoolullah ﷺ explained, "When the Pen (Qalam) used to write on the Protected Tablet (Lauhe-Mahfooz), I used to hear it even though I was in the womb of my mother. When the angels beneath the Arsh used to make tasbeeh, I used to hear it even though I was in the womb of my mother." - *Fataawa Abdul-Hayy, Kitaabul-Aqaaid, Pg. 43*

This narration proves that the Prophet ﷺ used to hear all sounds of the heavens and earth from the time he was in his mother's womb. The Ahadith state that whenever a woman fights with her husband, the Maidens (Hoors) of Jannat call out to her and curse her. We know from this that the Hoors see the fighting within the confines of a home and hear it as well. They also have Knowledge of the Unseen with which they know the result of this man. Distant sounds are heard by means of the radio or telephone. So, is the power of Sainthood (wilaayat) and Prophethood less than the power of wires? In the Me'raj, the Holy Prophet ﷺ heard the footstep of Hadrat Bilal ؓ, whereas the Sahaabi did not go for Me'raj but was at home. He must have been moving to perform Tahajjud Salaah here in the world, but the Holy Prophet ﷺ heard his footsteps there in the Heavens! If it is accepted that Hadrat Bilal ؓ also reached Jannat with a *misaali*

body, then Haazir & Naazir is proved.

The dissenters will say to all of this. "Allah ﷻ made them hear. That is why they heard all of this." We too say that Allah ﷻ makes the Prophets and Saints hear distant callings and it is through this that they hear. This is Allah's ﷻ original (zaati) quality and this is their successive (ataa'i) quality. It is *qadeem* for Him but *haadith* for them. For Allah ﷻ, this quality is not controlled by anyone but for the Prophets and Saints, it is controlled by Allah ﷻ. His listening is without the means of an ear, etc. and their listening is through the means of the ear. With so many differences, how can there be polytheism (shirk) in this? Much can be written on this subject, but we make do with the above



JANNATI KAUN?